# On representations of irrational numbers in subrecursive context 

Ivan Georgiev ${ }^{1}$<br>Prof. d-r Asen Zlatarov University, Burgas, Bulgaria

## Computability and Complexity in Analysis

Zagreb, Croatia, 8-11 July 2019
${ }^{1}$ This work was supported by the Bulgarian National Science Fund through contract DN-02-16/19.12.2016

## Acknowledgements

This is a joint research initiated by prof. Lars Kristiansen from Oslo University [2, 3] together with prof. Frank Stephan from the National University of Singapore.

## Acknowledgements

This is a joint research initiated by prof. Lars Kristiansen from Oslo University [2,3] together with prof. Frank Stephan from the National University of Singapore.

It is partially funded by the Bulgarian National Science Fund through the project "Models of Computablity", DN-02-16/19.12.2016.

## Introduction

There are many different ways to represent a real number $\xi$ :

## Introduction

There are many different ways to represent a real number $\xi$ :

- Dedekind cuts: $\xi$ is represented by the set $\{q \in \mathbb{Q} \mid q<\xi\}$.


## Introduction

There are many different ways to represent a real number $\xi$ :

- Dedekind cuts: $\xi$ is represented by the set $\{q \in \mathbb{Q} \mid q<\xi\}$.
- Cauchy sequences: $\xi$ is represented by a sequence $q: \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$, such that $\xi=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} q_{n}$.


## Introduction

There are many different ways to represent a real number $\xi$ :

- Dedekind cuts: $\xi$ is represented by the set $\{q \in \mathbb{Q} \mid q<\xi\}$.
- Cauchy sequences: $\xi$ is represented by a sequence $q: \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$, such that $\xi=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} q_{n}$.
- Base $b$-expansions: $\xi$ is represented by the sequence of its digits in base $b$.


## Introduction

There are many different ways to represent a real number $\xi$ :

- Dedekind cuts: $\xi$ is represented by the set $\{q \in \mathbb{Q} \mid q<\xi\}$.
- Cauchy sequences: $\xi$ is represented by a sequence $q: \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$, such that $\xi=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} q_{n}$.
- Base $b$-expansions: $\xi$ is represented by the sequence of its digits in base $b$.


## Introduction

There are many different ways to represent a real number $\xi$ :

- Dedekind cuts: $\xi$ is represented by the set $\{q \in \mathbb{Q} \mid q<\xi\}$.
- Cauchy sequences: $\xi$ is represented by a sequence $q: \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$, such that $\xi=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} q_{n}$.
- Base $b$-expansions: $\xi$ is represented by the sequence of its digits in base $b$.

Our aim is to compare the complexity of these representations.

## Introduction

There are many different ways to represent a real number $\xi$ :

- Dedekind cuts: $\xi$ is represented by the set $\{q \in \mathbb{Q} \mid q<\xi\}$.
- Cauchy sequences: $\xi$ is represented by a sequence $q: \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$, such that $\xi=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} q_{n}$.
- Base $b$-expansions: $\xi$ is represented by the sequence of its digits in base $b$.

Our aim is to compare the complexity of these representations. Our framework for complexity is subrecursive: roughly speaking, a computation is subrecursive if the number of iterations in any cycle can be computed in advance, before executing the cycle.

## Introduction

There are many different ways to represent a real number $\xi$ :

- Dedekind cuts: $\xi$ is represented by the set $\{q \in \mathbb{Q} \mid q<\xi\}$.
- Cauchy sequences: $\xi$ is represented by a sequence $q: \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$, such that $\xi=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} q_{n}$.
- Base $b$-expansions: $\xi$ is represented by the sequence of its digits in base $b$.

Our aim is to compare the complexity of these representations. Our framework for complexity is subrecursive: roughly speaking, a computation is subrecursive if the number of iterations in any cycle can be computed in advance, before executing the cycle. Thus unbounded search is not allowed in a subrecursive computation.

## Subrecursive functions

Let $\phi, \psi$ be total functions in $\mathbb{N}$.

## Subrecursive functions

Let $\phi, \psi$ be total functions in $\mathbb{N}$.
We say that $\phi$ is elementary in $\psi\left(\phi \leq_{E} \psi\right)$ iff $\phi$ can be generated from $\psi$ and the initial functions (projections, constants, successor, $\lambda n .2^{n}$ ) using composition and bounded primitive recursion.

## Subrecursive functions

Let $\phi, \psi$ be total functions in $\mathbb{N}$.
We say that $\phi$ is elementary in $\psi\left(\phi \leq_{E} \psi\right)$ iff $\phi$ can be generated from $\psi$ and the initial functions (projections, constants, successor, $\lambda n .2^{n}$ ) using composition and bounded primitive recursion.
The function $\phi$ is elementary iff $\phi \leq_{E} 0$.

## Subrecursive functions

Let $\phi, \psi$ be total functions in $\mathbb{N}$.
We say that $\phi$ is elementary in $\psi\left(\phi \leq_{E} \psi\right)$ iff $\phi$ can be generated from $\psi$ and the initial functions (projections, constants, successor, $\lambda n .2^{n}$ ) using composition and bounded primitive recursion.
The function $\phi$ is elementary iff $\phi \leq_{E} 0$.
We say that $\phi$ is primitive recursive in $\psi\left(\phi \leq_{P R} \psi\right)$ iff $\phi$ can be generated from $\psi$ and the initial functions using composition and (unbounded) primitive recursion.

## Subrecursive functions

Let $\phi, \psi$ be total functions in $\mathbb{N}$.
We say that $\phi$ is elementary in $\psi\left(\phi \leq_{E} \psi\right)$ iff $\phi$ can be generated from $\psi$ and the initial functions (projections, constants, successor, $\lambda n .2^{n}$ ) using composition and bounded primitive recursion.
The function $\phi$ is elementary iff $\phi \leq_{E} 0$.
We say that $\phi$ is primitive recursive in $\psi\left(\phi \leq_{P R} \psi\right)$ iff $\phi$ can be generated from $\psi$ and the initial functions using composition and (unbounded) primitive recursion.
The function $\phi$ is primitive recursive iff $\phi \leq_{P R} 0$.

## Subrecursive functions

Let $\phi, \psi$ be total functions in $\mathbb{N}$.
We say that $\phi$ is elementary in $\psi\left(\phi \leq_{E} \psi\right)$ iff $\phi$ can be generated from $\psi$ and the initial functions (projections, constants, successor, $\lambda n .2^{n}$ ) using composition and bounded primitive recursion.
The function $\phi$ is elementary iff $\phi \leq_{E} 0$.
We say that $\phi$ is primitive recursive in $\psi\left(\phi \leq_{P R} \psi\right)$ iff $\phi$ can be generated from $\psi$ and the initial functions using composition and (unbounded) primitive recursion.
The function $\phi$ is primitive recursive iff $\phi \leq_{P R} 0$.

A subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$ is any efficiently enumerable class of computable total functions in $\mathbb{N}$.

## Subrecursive functions

Let $\phi, \psi$ be total functions in $\mathbb{N}$.
We say that $\phi$ is elementary in $\psi\left(\phi \leq_{E} \psi\right)$ iff $\phi$ can be generated from $\psi$ and the initial functions (projections, constants, successor, $\lambda n .2^{n}$ ) using composition and bounded primitive recursion.
The function $\phi$ is elementary iff $\phi \leq_{E} 0$.
We say that $\phi$ is primitive recursive in $\psi\left(\phi \leq_{P R} \psi\right)$ iff $\phi$ can be generated from $\psi$ and the initial functions using composition and (unbounded) primitive recursion.
The function $\phi$ is primitive recursive iff $\phi \leq_{P R} 0$.
A subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$ is any efficiently enumerable class of computable total functions in $\mathbb{N}$.

We assume some elementary coding of $\mathbb{Z}$ and $\mathbb{Q}$ into $\mathbb{N}$.

## Representations of real numbers

Let $\xi$ be an irrational number.

## Representations of real numbers

Let $\xi$ be an irrational number.
Definition
The function $C: \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$ is a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$ if and only if for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$

$$
|C(n)-\xi|<\frac{1}{2^{n}}
$$

## Representations of real numbers

Let $\xi$ be an irrational number.
Definition
The function $C: \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$ is a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$ if and only if for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$

$$
|C(n)-\xi|<\frac{1}{2^{n}}
$$

The function $D: \mathbb{Q} \rightarrow\{0,1\}$ is a Dedekind cut of $\xi$ if and only if for all $q \in \mathbb{Q}$

$$
D(q)=0 \Leftrightarrow q<\xi
$$

## Representations of real numbers

Let $\xi$ be an irrational number.
Definition
The function $C: \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$ is a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$ if and only if for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$

$$
|C(n)-\xi|<\frac{1}{2^{n}}
$$

The function $D: \mathbb{Q} \rightarrow\{0,1\}$ is a Dedekind cut of $\xi$ if and only if for all $q \in \mathbb{Q}$

$$
D(q)=0 \Leftrightarrow q<\xi
$$

The function $T: \mathbb{Q} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$ is a trace function for $\xi$ if and only if for all $q \in \mathbb{Q}$

$$
|T(q)-\xi|<|q-\xi|
$$

## Recursive real numbers

## Proposition

The following are equivalent for an irrational number $\xi$ :

- there exists a computable Cauchy sequence for $\xi$;
- the Dedekind cut of $\xi$ is computable;
- there exists a computable trace function for $\xi$.


## From Dedekind cut to Cauchy sequence

Given a Dedekind cut of the irrational number $\xi$ we can subrecursively compute a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$.

## From Dedekind cut to Cauchy sequence

Given a Dedekind cut of the irrational number $\xi$ we can subrecursively compute a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$. In fact, we can compute subrecursively the decimal representation

$$
M . D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n} \ldots
$$

of $\xi$.

## From Dedekind cut to Cauchy sequence

Given a Dedekind cut of the irrational number $\xi$ we can subrecursively compute a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$. In fact, we can compute subrecursively the decimal representation

$$
M . D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n} \ldots
$$

of $\xi$. The whole part $M$ of $\xi$ may be used as a constant in the algorithm.

## From Dedekind cut to Cauchy sequence

Given a Dedekind cut of the irrational number $\xi$ we can subrecursively compute a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$. In fact, we can compute subrecursively the decimal representation

$$
M . D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n} \ldots
$$

of $\xi$. The whole part $M$ of $\xi$ may be used as a constant in the algorithm. The decimal digits $D_{1}, D_{2}, \ldots, D_{n}$ can be computed subrecursively from the Dedekind cut of $\xi$, since $D_{n} \in\{0,1, \ldots, 9\}$.

## From Dedekind cut to Cauchy sequence

Given a Dedekind cut of the irrational number $\xi$ we can subrecursively compute a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$. In fact, we can compute subrecursively the decimal representation

$$
M . D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n} \ldots
$$

of $\xi$. The whole part $M$ of $\xi$ may be used as a constant in the algorithm. The decimal digits $D_{1}, D_{2}, \ldots, D_{n}$ can be computed subrecursively from the Dedekind cut of $\xi$, since $D_{n} \in\{0,1, \ldots, 9\}$.
Finally, by taking

$$
q_{n}=M \cdot D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n}
$$

we obtain a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$.

## From Cauchy sequence to Dedekind cut

In the reverse direction, it is not possible to compute subrecursively the Dedekind cut of an irrational number $\xi$ given a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$.

## From Cauchy sequence to Dedekind cut

In the reverse direction, it is not possible to compute subrecursively the Dedekind cut of an irrational number $\xi$ given a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$.
To decide whether $q<\xi$ given a Cauchy sequence $q_{n}$ for $\xi$ an unbounded search is needed to produce an interval, containing $\xi$, which is either to the left or to the right of $q$.

## From Cauchy sequence to Dedekind cut

In the reverse direction, it is not possible to compute subrecursively the Dedekind cut of an irrational number $\xi$ given a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$.
To decide whether $q<\xi$ given a Cauchy sequence $q_{n}$ for $\xi$ an unbounded search is needed to produce an interval, containing $\xi$, which is either to the left or to the right of $q$.


## From Cauchy sequence to Dedekind cut

In the reverse direction, it is not possible to compute subrecursively the Dedekind cut of an irrational number $\xi$ given a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$.
To decide whether $q<\xi$ given a Cauchy sequence $q_{n}$ for $\xi$ an unbounded search is needed to produce an interval, containing $\xi$, which is either to the left or to the right of $q$.


## Dedekind cuts and trace functions

Given a trace function $T$ of an irrational number $\xi$ we can subrecursively compute the Dedekind cut of $\xi$ by

$$
\begin{aligned}
& T(q)<q \Rightarrow \xi<q \\
& T(q)>q \Rightarrow q<\xi
\end{aligned}
$$

## Dedekind cuts and trace functions

Given a trace function $T$ of an irrational number $\xi$ we can subrecursively compute the Dedekind cut of $\xi$ by

$$
\begin{aligned}
& T(q)<q \Rightarrow \xi<q \\
& T(q)>q \Rightarrow q<\xi
\end{aligned}
$$

But conversely, given the Dedekind cut of $\xi$ is not possible to obtain a trace function $T$ subrecursively.

## Dedekind cuts and trace functions

Given a trace function $T$ of an irrational number $\xi$ we can subrecursively compute the Dedekind cut of $\xi$ by

$$
\begin{aligned}
& T(q)<q \Rightarrow \xi<q \\
& T(q)>q \Rightarrow q<\xi
\end{aligned}
$$

But conversely, given the Dedekind cut of $\xi$ is not possible to obtain a trace function $T$ subrecursively. Given $q \in \mathbb{Q}$, an unbounded search is needed to find $T(q) \in \mathbb{Q}$, such that $q<T(q)<\xi$ or $\xi<T(q)<q$.

## Formal result

For a class $\mathcal{S}$ of functions, we denote by $\mathcal{S}_{T}, \mathcal{S}_{D}, \mathcal{S}_{C}$ the set of all real numbers, which have a trace function, Dedekind cut or Cauchy sequence in $\mathcal{S}$, respectively.

## Formal result

For a class $\mathcal{S}$ of functions, we denote by $\mathcal{S}_{T}, \mathcal{S}_{D}, \mathcal{S}_{C}$ the set of all real numbers, which have a trace function, Dedekind cut or Cauchy sequence in $\mathcal{S}$, respectively.
Theorem (Kristiansen)
For any subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$, closed under elementary operations we have

$$
\mathcal{S}_{T} \subset \mathcal{S}_{D} \subset \mathcal{S}_{C}
$$

## Base-b expansions

From now on we consider only irrational numbers $\xi \in(0,1)$.

## Base- $b$ expansions

From now on we consider only irrational numbers $\xi \in(0,1)$.
For any base $b \geq 2$, there exists a unique sequence $D_{1}, D_{2}, \ldots, D_{n} \ldots$ of $b$-digits, such that for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$

$$
0 . D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n}<\xi<0 . D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n}+\frac{1}{b^{n}} .
$$

## Base- $b$ expansions

From now on we consider only irrational numbers $\xi \in(0,1)$.
For any base $b \geq 2$, there exists a unique sequence $D_{1}, D_{2}, \ldots, D_{n} \ldots$ of $b$-digits, such that for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$

$$
0 . D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n}<\xi<0 . D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n}+\frac{1}{b^{n}}
$$

For a class $\mathcal{S}$ of functions, we denote by $\mathcal{S}_{b E}$ the set of all real numbers, whose sequence of $b$-digits belongs to $\mathcal{S}$.

## Base- $b$ expansions

From now on we consider only irrational numbers $\xi \in(0,1)$.
For any base $b \geq 2$, there exists a unique sequence
$D_{1}, D_{2}, \ldots, D_{n} \ldots$ of $b$-digits, such that for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$

$$
0 . D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n}<\xi<0 . D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n}+\frac{1}{b^{n}}
$$

For a class $\mathcal{S}$ of functions, we denote by $\mathcal{S}_{b E}$ the set of all real numbers, whose sequence of $b$-digits belongs to $\mathcal{S}$.
Theorem (Mostowski, Kristiansen)
For any subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$, closed under elementary operations and any two bases $a, b$ we have

$$
\mathcal{S}_{b E} \subseteq \mathcal{S}_{a E} \Longleftrightarrow \text { every prime factor of } a \text { is a prime factor of } b
$$

## Base- $b$ expansions

From now on we consider only irrational numbers $\xi \in(0,1)$.
For any base $b \geq 2$, there exists a unique sequence
$D_{1}, D_{2}, \ldots, D_{n} \ldots$ of $b$-digits, such that for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$

$$
0 . D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n}<\xi<0 . D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n}+\frac{1}{b^{n}} .
$$

For a class $\mathcal{S}$ of functions, we denote by $\mathcal{S}_{b E}$ the set of all real numbers, whose sequence of $b$-digits belongs to $\mathcal{S}$.
Theorem (Mostowski, Kristiansen)
For any subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$, closed under elementary operations and any two bases $a, b$ we have

$$
\mathcal{S}_{b E} \subseteq \mathcal{S}_{a E} \Longleftrightarrow \text { every prime factor of } a \text { is a prime factor of } b
$$

It follows that

$$
\mathcal{S}_{T} \subset \mathcal{S}_{D} \subset \mathcal{S}_{b E} \subset \mathcal{S}_{C}
$$

for any subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$, closed under elementary operations and any base $b \geq 2$.

## $\mathcal{E}^{2}$-irrationality

## Definition

A real number $\xi$ will be called $\mathcal{E}^{2}$-irrational iff there exists a function $v \in \mathcal{E}^{2}$, such that

$$
\left|\xi-\frac{m}{n}\right|>\frac{1}{v(n)}
$$

for all integers $m$ and $n>0$.

## $\mathcal{E}^{2}$-irrationality

## Definition

A real number $\xi$ will be called $\mathcal{E}^{2}$-irrational iff there exists a function $v \in \mathcal{E}^{2}$, such that

$$
\left|\xi-\frac{m}{n}\right|>\frac{1}{v(n)}
$$

for all integers $m$ and $n>0$.
In fact, $\xi$ is $\mathcal{E}^{2}$-irrational iff $\xi$ has a finite irrationality measure and $v$ can be chosen a polynomial of $n$.

## $\mathcal{E}^{2}$-irrationality

## Definition

A real number $\xi$ will be called $\mathcal{E}^{2}$-irrational iff there exists a function $v \in \mathcal{E}^{2}$, such that

$$
\left|\xi-\frac{m}{n}\right|>\frac{1}{v(n)}
$$

for all integers $m$ and $n>0$.
In fact, $\xi$ is $\mathcal{E}^{2}$-irrational iff $\xi$ has a finite irrationality measure and $v$ can be chosen a polynomial of $n$.

Theorem
For a subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$, closed under elementary operations and a real number $\xi$, which is $\mathcal{E}^{2}$-irrational we have:

$$
\xi \in \mathcal{S}_{T} \Longleftrightarrow \xi \in \mathcal{S}_{D} \Longleftrightarrow \xi \in \mathcal{S}_{b E} \Longleftrightarrow \xi \in \mathcal{S}_{C}
$$

## Arbitrary base representation I

We denote $\mathcal{S}_{E}=\bigcup_{b=2}^{\infty} \mathcal{S}_{b E}$.

## Arbitrary base representation I

We denote $\mathcal{S}_{E}=\bigcup_{b=2}^{\infty} \mathcal{S}_{b E}$.
Theorem
There exists a real number $\xi$, such that $\xi \in \mathcal{S}_{C}$ and $\xi \notin \mathcal{S}_{E}$.

## Arbitrary base representation I

We denote $\mathcal{S}_{E}=\bigcup_{b=2}^{\infty} \mathcal{S}_{b E}$.
Theorem
There exists a real number $\xi$, such that $\xi \in \mathcal{S}_{C}$ and $\xi \notin \mathcal{S}_{E}$.
The theorem can be generalised in the following way:
Theorem
For any $\mathcal{E}^{2}$-irrational number $\alpha \in \mathcal{S}_{C}$ there exists an $\mathcal{E}^{2}$-irrational number $\beta \in \mathcal{S}_{C}$, such that $\alpha+\beta \notin \mathcal{S}_{E}$.

## Arbitrary base representation I

We denote $\mathcal{S}_{E}=\bigcup_{b=2}^{\infty} \mathcal{S}_{b E}$.
Theorem
There exists a real number $\xi$, such that $\xi \in \mathcal{S}_{C}$ and $\xi \notin \mathcal{S}_{E}$.
The theorem can be generalised in the following way:
Theorem
For any $\mathcal{E}^{2}$-irrational number $\alpha \in \mathcal{S}_{C}$ there exists an $\mathcal{E}^{2}$-irrational number $\beta \in \mathcal{S}_{C}$, such that $\alpha+\beta \notin \mathcal{S}_{E}$.
And similarly:
Theorem
For any $\mathcal{E}^{2}$-irrational number $\alpha \in \mathcal{S}_{C}$ there exists an $\mathcal{E}^{2}$-irrational number $\beta \in \mathcal{S}_{C}$, such that $\alpha \beta \notin \mathcal{S}_{E}$.

## Arbitrary base representation II

Let $R$ any of the known representations, not equivalent to Cauchy sequences and $\mathcal{S}_{R}$ be the set of irrational numbers, which possess an $R$-representation, computable through functions from $\mathcal{S}$.

## Arbitrary base representation II

Let $R$ any of the known representations, not equivalent to Cauchy sequences and $\mathcal{S}_{R}$ be the set of irrational numbers, which possess an $R$-representation, computable through functions from $\mathcal{S}$. Then we have

$$
\left\{\alpha \in \mathcal{S}_{C} \mid \alpha \text { is } \mathcal{E}^{2} \text {-irrational }\right\} \subseteq \mathcal{S}_{R} \subseteq \mathcal{S}_{E}
$$

## Arbitrary base representation II

Let $R$ any of the known representations, not equivalent to Cauchy sequences and $\mathcal{S}_{R}$ be the set of irrational numbers, which possess an $R$-representation, computable through functions from $\mathcal{S}$. Then we have

$$
\left\{\alpha \in \mathcal{S}_{C} \mid \alpha \text { is } \mathcal{E}^{2} \text {-irrational }\right\} \subseteq \mathcal{S}_{R} \subseteq \mathcal{S}_{E}
$$

and it follows from the last two theorems that $\mathcal{S}_{R}$ is not closed under addition or multiplication.

## Base- $b$ sum approximations from below

Let us fix some base $b$. Any irrational number $\xi \in(0,1)$ can be written in the form

$$
\xi=\frac{d_{1}}{b^{k_{1}}}+\frac{d_{2}}{b^{k_{2}}}+\frac{d_{3}}{b^{k_{3}}}+\ldots
$$

where $k_{n}$ is a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers and $d_{n}$ are non-zero base- $b$ digits, $d_{n} \in\{1, \ldots, b-1\}$.

## Base- $b$ sum approximations from below

Let us fix some base $b$. Any irrational number $\xi \in(0,1)$ can be written in the form

$$
\xi=\frac{d_{1}}{b^{k_{1}}}+\frac{d_{2}}{b^{k_{2}}}+\frac{d_{3}}{b^{k_{3}}}+\ldots
$$

where $k_{n}$ is a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers and $d_{n}$ are non-zero base- $b$ digits, $d_{n} \in\{1, \ldots, b-1\}$.
Definition
The function $\hat{A}_{b}^{\xi}$, defined by $\hat{A}_{b}^{\xi}(n)=d_{n} b^{-k_{n}}$ for $n>0$ and $\hat{A}_{b}^{\xi}(0)=0$ is called base-b sum approximation from below of the number $\xi$.

## Base- $b$ sum approximations from below

Let us fix some base $b$. Any irrational number $\xi \in(0,1)$ can be written in the form

$$
\xi=\frac{d_{1}}{b^{k_{1}}}+\frac{d_{2}}{b^{k_{2}}}+\frac{d_{3}}{b^{k_{3}}}+\ldots
$$

where $k_{n}$ is a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers and $d_{n}$ are non-zero base- $b$ digits, $d_{n} \in\{1, \ldots, b-1\}$.
Definition
The function $\hat{A}_{b}^{\xi}$, defined by $\hat{A}_{b}^{\xi}(n)=d_{n} b^{-k_{n}}$ for $n>0$ and $\hat{A}_{b}^{\xi}(0)=0$ is called base-b sum approximation from below of the number $\xi$.
For a class of functions $\mathcal{S}$ we denote by $\mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow}$ the set of all real numbers, which have a base- $b$ sum approximation from below in $\mathcal{S}$, that is

$$
\xi \in \mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow} \Longleftrightarrow \hat{A}_{b}^{\xi} \in \mathcal{S}
$$

## Base- $b$ sum approximations from above

Moreover, we can write

$$
\xi=1-\frac{d_{1}^{\prime}}{b^{m_{1}}}-\frac{d_{2}^{\prime}}{b^{m_{2}}}-\frac{d_{3}^{\prime}}{b^{m_{3}}}-\ldots,
$$

where $m_{n}$ is a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers and $d_{n}^{\prime}$ are non-zero base- $b$ digits.

## Base- $b$ sum approximations from above

Moreover, we can write

$$
\xi=1-\frac{d_{1}^{\prime}}{b^{m_{1}}}-\frac{d_{2}^{\prime}}{b^{m_{2}}}-\frac{d_{3}^{\prime}}{b^{m_{3}}}-\ldots
$$

where $m_{n}$ is a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers and $d_{n}^{\prime}$ are non-zero base- $b$ digits.
Definition
The function $\check{A}_{b}^{\xi}$, defined by $\check{A}_{b}^{\xi}(n)=d_{n}^{\prime} b^{-m_{n}}$ for $n>0$ and $\breve{A}_{b}^{\xi}(0)=0$ is called base-b sum approximation from above of the number $\xi$.

## Base- $b$ sum approximations from above

Moreover, we can write

$$
\xi=1-\frac{d_{1}^{\prime}}{b^{m_{1}}}-\frac{d_{2}^{\prime}}{b^{m_{2}}}-\frac{d_{3}^{\prime}}{b^{m_{3}}}-\ldots
$$

where $m_{n}$ is a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers and $d_{n}^{\prime}$ are non-zero base- $b$ digits.
Definition
The function $\check{A}_{b}^{\xi}$, defined by $\check{A}_{b}^{\xi}(n)=d_{n}^{\prime} b^{-m_{n}}$ for $n>0$ and $\breve{A}_{b}^{\xi}(0)=0$ is called base-b sum approximation from above of the number $\xi$.
For a class of functions $\mathcal{S}$ we denote by $\mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow}$ the set of all real numbers, which have a base- $b$ sum approximation from above in $\mathcal{S}$, that is

$$
\xi \in \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow} \Longleftrightarrow \check{A}_{b}^{\xi} \in \mathcal{S} .
$$

## Example in base 10

For example, let us have $\xi=0.05439990003 \ldots$ in base $b=10$.

## Example in base 10

For example, let us have $\xi=0.05439990003 \ldots$ in base $b=10$. Then

$$
\xi=\frac{5}{10^{2}}+\frac{4}{10^{3}}+\frac{3}{10^{4}}+\frac{9}{10^{5}}+\frac{9}{10^{6}}+\frac{9}{10^{7}}+\frac{3}{10^{11}}+\ldots,
$$

## Example in base 10

For example, let us have $\xi=0.05439990003 \ldots$ in base $b=10$. Then

$$
\xi=\frac{5}{10^{2}}+\frac{4}{10^{3}}+\frac{3}{10^{4}}+\frac{9}{10^{5}}+\frac{9}{10^{6}}+\frac{9}{10^{7}}+\frac{3}{10^{11}}+\ldots,
$$

thus

$$
\hat{A}_{10}^{\xi}(1)=\frac{5}{10^{2}}, \quad \hat{A}_{10}^{\xi}(2)=\frac{4}{10^{3}}, \ldots
$$

## Example in base 10

For example, let us have $\xi=0.05439990003 \ldots$ in base $b=10$. Then

$$
\xi=\frac{5}{10^{2}}+\frac{4}{10^{3}}+\frac{3}{10^{4}}+\frac{9}{10^{5}}+\frac{9}{10^{6}}+\frac{9}{10^{7}}+\frac{3}{10^{11}}+\ldots,
$$

thus

$$
\hat{A}_{10}^{\xi}(1)=\frac{5}{10^{2}}, \quad \hat{A}_{10}^{\xi}(2)=\frac{4}{10^{3}}, \ldots
$$

Moreover,
$\xi=1-\frac{9}{10^{1}}-\frac{4}{10^{2}}-\frac{5}{10^{3}}-\frac{6}{10^{4}}-\frac{9}{10^{8}}-\frac{9}{10^{9}}-\frac{9}{10^{10}}-\frac{6}{10^{11}}+\ldots$,

## Example in base 10

For example, let us have $\xi=0.05439990003 \ldots$ in base $b=10$. Then

$$
\xi=\frac{5}{10^{2}}+\frac{4}{10^{3}}+\frac{3}{10^{4}}+\frac{9}{10^{5}}+\frac{9}{10^{6}}+\frac{9}{10^{7}}+\frac{3}{10^{11}}+\ldots,
$$

thus

$$
\hat{A}_{10}^{\xi}(1)=\frac{5}{10^{2}}, \quad \hat{A}_{10}^{\xi}(2)=\frac{4}{10^{3}}, \ldots
$$

Moreover,
$\xi=1-\frac{9}{10^{1}}-\frac{4}{10^{2}}-\frac{5}{10^{3}}-\frac{6}{10^{4}}-\frac{9}{10^{8}}-\frac{9}{10^{9}}-\frac{9}{10^{10}}-\frac{6}{10^{11}}+\ldots$,
thus

$$
\check{A}_{10}^{\xi}(1)=\frac{9}{10^{1}}, \quad \check{A}_{10}^{\xi}(2)=\frac{4}{10^{2}}, \ldots
$$

## Results on sum approximations

Theorem (Kristiansen)
Let $\mathcal{S}$ be a subrecursive class, closed under elementary operations.
For any base $b$ we have

$$
\mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow} \nsubseteq \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow} \text { and } \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow} \nsubseteq \mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow}
$$

## Results on sum approximations

Theorem (Kristiansen)
Let $\mathcal{S}$ be a subrecursive class, closed under elementary operations.
For any base $b$ we have

$$
\mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow} \nsubseteq \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow} \text { and } \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow} \nsubseteq \mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow}
$$

It easily follows that

$$
\mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow} \subset \mathcal{S}_{b E} \text { and } \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow} \subset \mathcal{S}_{b E}
$$

## Arbitary base sum approximation

$$
\text { Let us denote } \mathcal{S}_{\uparrow}=\bigcup_{b=2}^{\infty} \mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow}, \quad \mathcal{S}_{\downarrow}=\bigcup_{b=2}^{\infty} \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow} \text {. }
$$

## Arbitary base sum approximation

Let us denote $\mathcal{S}_{\uparrow}=\bigcup_{b=2}^{\infty} \mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow}, \quad \mathcal{S}_{\downarrow}=\bigcup_{b=2}^{\infty} \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow}$.
Kristiansen conjectured that $\mathcal{S}_{\uparrow}=\mathcal{S}_{\downarrow}=\mathcal{S}_{E}$.

## Arbitary base sum approximation

Let us denote $\mathcal{S}_{\uparrow}=\bigcup_{b=2}^{\infty} \mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow}, \quad \mathcal{S}_{\downarrow}=\bigcup_{b=2}^{\infty} \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow}$.
Kristiansen conjectured that $\mathcal{S}_{\uparrow}=\mathcal{S}_{\downarrow}=\mathcal{S}_{E}$.
Theorem
For any finite set of primes $\left\{p_{1}, \ldots, p_{k}\right\}$ and prime $p$ not belonging to the set there exists a real number $\xi$, such that $\xi \in \mathcal{S}_{p_{1} \uparrow} \cap \ldots \cap \mathcal{S}_{p_{k} \uparrow}$ and $\xi \notin \mathcal{S}_{p \uparrow}$.

## Arbitary base sum approximation

Let us denote $\mathcal{S}_{\uparrow}=\bigcup_{b=2}^{\infty} \mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow}, \quad \mathcal{S}_{\downarrow}=\bigcup_{b=2}^{\infty} \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow}$.
Kristiansen conjectured that $\mathcal{S}_{\uparrow}=\mathcal{S}_{\downarrow}=\mathcal{S}_{E}$.
Theorem
For any finite set of primes $\left\{p_{1}, \ldots, p_{k}\right\}$ and prime $p$ not belonging to the set there exists a real number $\xi$, such that
$\xi \in \mathcal{S}_{p_{1} \uparrow} \cap \ldots \cap \mathcal{S}_{p_{k} \uparrow}$ and $\xi \notin \mathcal{S}_{p \uparrow}$.
But actually the conjecture is false:
Theorem
There exist a real number $\xi \in \mathcal{S}_{D}$, such that $\xi \notin \mathcal{S}_{\uparrow}$.

## Bibliography

國 Ivan Georgiev，Lars Kristiansen，Frank Stephan．
On general sum approximations of irrational numbers．
CiE 2018 Proceedings，Lectures Notes in Computer Science， vol． 10936 （2018），194－203．
圊 Lars Kristiansen．
On subrecursive representability of irrational numbers．
Computability，vol．6（3）（2017），249－276．
围 Lars Kristiansen．
On subrecursive representability of irrational numbers，part II． Computability，vol．8（1）（2019），43－65．

Thank you for your attention!

