# On the complexity of irrational numbers under different representations 

Ivan Georgiev<br>Prof. Asen Zlatarov University, Burgas, Bulgaria

Scientific session, dedicated to the 80th anniversary of Prof. Dimiter Vakarelov

Gyolechitsa, 12-14 May 2018

## Acknowledgements

This is a joint research initiated by prof. Lars Kristiansen from Oslo University [2, 3] together with prof. Frank Stephan from the National University of Singapore.

## Acknowledgements

This is a joint research initiated by prof. Lars Kristiansen from Oslo University [2,3] together with prof. Frank Stephan from the National University of Singapore.

It is partially funded by the Bulgarian National Science Fund through the project "Models of computability",
DN-02-16/19.12.2016.

## Introduction

There are many different ways to represent a real number $\xi$ :

## Introduction

There are many different ways to represent a real number $\xi$ :

- Dedekind cuts: the real number $\xi$ is represented by the set of all rationals $q<\xi$.


## Introduction

There are many different ways to represent a real number $\xi$ :

- Dedekind cuts: the real number $\xi$ is represented by the set of all rationals $q<\xi$.
- Cauchy sequences: the real number $\xi$ is represented by a sequence $q_{n}$ of rationals, which converges to $\xi$ with a pre-specified rate of convergence.


## Introduction

There are many different ways to represent a real number $\xi$ :

- Dedekind cuts: the real number $\xi$ is represented by the set of all rationals $q<\xi$.
- Cauchy sequences: the real number $\xi$ is represented by a sequence $q_{n}$ of rationals, which converges to $\xi$ with a pre-specified rate of convergence.
- Base $b$-expansions: the real number $\xi$ is represented by its sequence of digits in base $b \geq 2$.


## Introduction

There are many different ways to represent a real number $\xi$ :

- Dedekind cuts: the real number $\xi$ is represented by the set of all rationals $q<\xi$.
- Cauchy sequences: the real number $\xi$ is represented by a sequence $q_{n}$ of rationals, which converges to $\xi$ with a pre-specified rate of convergence.
- Base $b$-expansions: the real number $\xi$ is represented by its sequence of digits in base $b \geq 2$.
Our aim is to compare the complexity of these representations.


## Introduction

There are many different ways to represent a real number $\xi$ :

- Dedekind cuts: the real number $\xi$ is represented by the set of all rationals $q<\xi$.
- Cauchy sequences: the real number $\xi$ is represented by a sequence $q_{n}$ of rationals, which converges to $\xi$ with a pre-specified rate of convergence.
- Base $b$-expansions: the real number $\xi$ is represented by its sequence of digits in base $b \geq 2$.
Our aim is to compare the complexity of these representations.
Our framework for complexity is subrecursive: roughly speaking, a computation is subrecursive if the number of iterations in any cycle can be computed in advance, just before executing the cycle.


## Introduction

There are many different ways to represent a real number $\xi$ :

- Dedekind cuts: the real number $\xi$ is represented by the set of all rationals $q<\xi$.
- Cauchy sequences: the real number $\xi$ is represented by a sequence $q_{n}$ of rationals, which converges to $\xi$ with a pre-specified rate of convergence.
- Base $b$-expansions: the real number $\xi$ is represented by its sequence of digits in base $b \geq 2$.
Our aim is to compare the complexity of these representations.
Our framework for complexity is subrecursive: roughly speaking, a computation is subrecursive if the number of iterations in any cycle can be computed in advance, just before executing the cycle. Thus unbounded search is not allowed in a subrecursive computation.


## Representations of real numbers

Let $\xi$ be an irrational number.
Definition
The function $C: \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$ is a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$ if and only if for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$

$$
|C(n)-\xi|<\frac{1}{2^{n}}
$$

## Representations of real numbers

Let $\xi$ be an irrational number.
Definition
The function $C: \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$ is a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$ if and only if for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$

$$
|C(n)-\xi|<\frac{1}{2^{n}}
$$

The function $D: \mathbb{Q} \rightarrow\{0,1\}$ is a Dedekind cut of $\xi$ if and only if for all $q \in \mathbb{Q}$

$$
D(q)=0 \Leftrightarrow q<\xi
$$

## Representations of real numbers

Let $\xi$ be an irrational number.
Definition
The function $C: \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$ is a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$ if and only if for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$

$$
|C(n)-\xi|<\frac{1}{2^{n}}
$$

The function $D: \mathbb{Q} \rightarrow\{0,1\}$ is a Dedekind cut of $\xi$ if and only if for all $q \in \mathbb{Q}$

$$
D(q)=0 \Leftrightarrow q<\xi
$$

The function $T: \mathbb{Q} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$ is a trace function for $\xi$ if and only if for all $q \in \mathbb{Q}$

$$
|T(q)-\xi|<|q-\xi|
$$

## Subrecursive classes

Let $\phi, \psi$ be total functions in the natural numbers.
We say that $\phi$ is elementary in $\psi\left(\phi \leq_{E} \psi\right)$ if and only if $\phi$ can be generated from $\psi$ and the initial functions (projections, constants, successor, $\lambda n .2^{n}$ ) using elementary operations (composition and bounded primitive recursion).

## Subrecursive classes

Let $\phi, \psi$ be total functions in the natural numbers.
We say that $\phi$ is elementary in $\psi\left(\phi \leq_{E} \psi\right)$ if and only if $\phi$ can be generated from $\psi$ and the initial functions (projections, constants, successor, $\lambda n .2^{n}$ ) using elementary operations (composition and bounded primitive recursion).
The function $\phi$ is elementary if and only if $\phi \leq_{E} 0$.

## Subrecursive classes

Let $\phi, \psi$ be total functions in the natural numbers.
We say that $\phi$ is elementary in $\psi\left(\phi \leq_{E} \psi\right)$ if and only if $\phi$ can be generated from $\psi$ and the initial functions (projections, constants, successor, $\lambda n .2^{n}$ ) using elementary operations (composition and bounded primitive recursion).
The function $\phi$ is elementary if and only if $\phi \leq_{E} 0$.
We say that $\phi$ is primitive recursive in $\psi\left(\phi \leq_{P R} \psi\right)$ if and only if $\phi$ can be generated from $\psi$ and the initial functions using primitive recursive operations (composition and (unbounded) primitive recursion).

## Subrecursive classes

Let $\phi, \psi$ be total functions in the natural numbers.
We say that $\phi$ is elementary in $\psi\left(\phi \leq_{E} \psi\right)$ if and only if $\phi$ can be generated from $\psi$ and the initial functions (projections, constants, successor, $\lambda n .2^{n}$ ) using elementary operations (composition and bounded primitive recursion).
The function $\phi$ is elementary if and only if $\phi \leq_{E} 0$.
We say that $\phi$ is primitive recursive in $\psi\left(\phi \leq_{P R} \psi\right)$ if and only if $\phi$ can be generated from $\psi$ and the initial functions using primitive recursive operations (composition and (unbounded) primitive recursion).
The function $\phi$ is primitive recursive if and only if $\phi \leq_{P R} 0$.

## Subrecursive classes

Let $\phi, \psi$ be total functions in the natural numbers.
We say that $\phi$ is elementary in $\psi\left(\phi \leq_{E} \psi\right)$ if and only if $\phi$ can be generated from $\psi$ and the initial functions (projections, constants, successor, $\lambda n .2^{n}$ ) using elementary operations (composition and bounded primitive recursion).
The function $\phi$ is elementary if and only if $\phi \leq_{E} 0$.
We say that $\phi$ is primitive recursive in $\psi\left(\phi \leq_{P R} \psi\right)$ if and only if
$\phi$ can be generated from $\psi$ and the initial functions using primitive recursive operations (composition and (unbounded) primitive recursion).
The function $\phi$ is primitive recursive if and only if $\phi \leq_{P R} 0$. We assume some coding of $\mathbb{Z}$ and $\mathbb{Q}$ into the natural numbers. Under this coding all of the usual basic operations will be elementary. Thus we allow $\mathbb{Z}$ or $\mathbb{Q}$ in place of $\mathbb{N}$ for the arguments and/or the result of the functions $\phi, \psi$.

## Subrecursive classes II

A function $h: \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ is honest if $h$ is monotonically increasing $(h(n) \leq h(n+1))$, dominates $\lambda n .2^{n}\left(h(n) \geq 2^{n}\right)$ and has elementary graph (the relation $f(x)=y$ is elementary).

## Subrecursive classes II

A function $h: \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ is honest if $h$ is monotonically increasing $(h(n) \leq h(n+1))$, dominates $\lambda n .2^{n}\left(h(n) \geq 2^{n}\right)$ and has elementary graph (the relation $f(x)=y$ is elementary). A subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$ is any efficiently enumerable class of computable total functions.

## Subrecursive classes II

A function $h: \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ is honest if $h$ is monotonically increasing $(h(n) \leq h(n+1))$, dominates $\lambda n .2^{n}\left(h(n) \geq 2^{n}\right)$ and has elementary graph (the relation $f(x)=y$ is elementary). A subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$ is any efficiently enumerable class of computable total functions.
For any subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$ there exists an honest function $f$, such that $f \notin \mathcal{S}$.

## Subrecursive classes II

A function $h: \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ is honest if $h$ is monotonically increasing $(h(n) \leq h(n+1))$, dominates $\lambda n .2^{n}\left(h(n) \geq 2^{n}\right)$ and has elementary graph (the relation $f(x)=y$ is elementary). A subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$ is any efficiently enumerable class of computable total functions.
For any subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$ there exists an honest function $f$, such that $f \notin \mathcal{S}$.
Roughly speaking, the graph of $f$ is easily computable, but $f$ grows too fast to belong ot $\mathcal{S}$.

## Recursive real numbers

## Proposition

The following are equivalent for an irrational number $\xi$ :

- there exists a computable Cauchy sequence for $\xi$;
- the Dedekind cut of $\xi$ is computable;
- there exists a computable trace function for $\xi$.


## Recursive real numbers

## Proposition

The following are equivalent for an irrational number $\xi$ :

- there exists a computable Cauchy sequence for $\xi$;
- the Dedekind cut of $\xi$ is computable;
- there exists a computable trace function for $\xi$.

The proof is uniform in $\xi$, because $\xi$ is assumed irrational.

## Recursive real numbers

## Proposition

The following are equivalent for an irrational number $\xi$ :

- there exists a computable Cauchy sequence for $\xi$;
- the Dedekind cut of $\xi$ is computable;
- there exists a computable trace function for $\xi$.

The proof is uniform in $\xi$, because $\xi$ is assumed irrational.
Without this assumption the uniformity is lost, but the proposition remains true.

## Recursive real numbers

## Proposition

The following are equivalent for an irrational number $\xi$ :

- there exists a computable Cauchy sequence for $\xi$;
- the Dedekind cut of $\xi$ is computable;
- there exists a computable trace function for $\xi$.

The proof is uniform in $\xi$, because $\xi$ is assumed irrational.
Without this assumption the uniformity is lost, but the proposition remains true.
From our viewpoint any representation of the rational numbers is considered trivial.

## From Dedekind cut to Cauchy sequence

Given a Dedekind cut of the irrational number $\xi$ we can subrecursively compute a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$.

## From Dedekind cut to Cauchy sequence

Given a Dedekind cut of the irrational number $\xi$ we can subrecursively compute a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$.
In fact, we can compute subrecursively the decimal digits of $\xi$.

## From Dedekind cut to Cauchy sequence

Given a Dedekind cut of the irrational number $\xi$ we can subrecursively compute a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$.
In fact, we can compute subrecursively the decimal digits of $\xi$. The only problem is with the whole part of $\xi$ : an unbounded search is needed to find $n \in \mathbb{N}$, such that $n<\xi<n+1$.

## From Dedekind cut to Cauchy sequence

Given a Dedekind cut of the irrational number $\xi$ we can subrecursively compute a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$. In fact, we can compute subrecursively the decimal digits of $\xi$. The only problem is with the whole part of $\xi$ : an unbounded search is needed to find $n \in \mathbb{N}$, such that $n<\xi<n+1$. We assume we know this $n$ in advance and use it as a constant in the algorithm.

## From Dedekind cut to Cauchy sequence

Given a Dedekind cut of the irrational number $\xi$ we can subrecursively compute a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$.
In fact, we can compute subrecursively the decimal digits of $\xi$.
The only problem is with the whole part of $\xi$ : an unbounded search is needed to find $n \in \mathbb{N}$, such that $n<\xi<n+1$.
We assume we know this $n$ in advance and use it as a constant in the algorithm.
The remaining digits to the right of the decimal point of $\xi$ can be computed subrecursively.

## From Dedekind cut to Cauchy sequence

Given a Dedekind cut of the irrational number $\xi$ we can subrecursively compute a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$.
In fact, we can compute subrecursively the decimal digits of $\xi$.
The only problem is with the whole part of $\xi$ : an unbounded search is needed to find $n \in \mathbb{N}$, such that $n<\xi<n+1$.
We assume we know this $n$ in advance and use it as a constant in the algorithm.
The remaining digits to the right of the decimal point of $\xi$ can be computed subrecursively.
Finally, by taking $q_{n}$ to be the rational number, consisting of the whole part of $\xi$ and its first $n$ digits after the decimal point, we obtain a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$.

## From Cauchy sequence to Dedekind cut

In the reverse direction, it is not possible to compute subrecursively the Dedekind cut of an irrational number $\xi$ given a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$.

## From Cauchy sequence to Dedekind cut

In the reverse direction, it is not possible to compute subrecursively the Dedekind cut of an irrational number $\xi$ given a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$.
To decide whether $q<\xi$ given a Cauchy sequence $q_{n}$ for $\xi$ an unbounded search is needed to produce an interval, containing $\xi$, which is either to the left or to the right of $q$.

## From Cauchy sequence to Dedekind cut

In the reverse direction, it is not possible to compute subrecursively the Dedekind cut of an irrational number $\xi$ given a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$.
To decide whether $q<\xi$ given a Cauchy sequence $q_{n}$ for $\xi$ an unbounded search is needed to produce an interval, containing $\xi$, which is either to the left or to the right of $q$.


## From Cauchy sequence to Dedekind cut

In the reverse direction, it is not possible to compute subrecursively the Dedekind cut of an irrational number $\xi$ given a Cauchy sequence for $\xi$.
To decide whether $q<\xi$ given a Cauchy sequence $q_{n}$ for $\xi$ an unbounded search is needed to produce an interval, containing $\xi$, which is either to the left or to the right of $q$.


## Dedekind cuts and trace functions

Given a trace function $T$ of an irrational number $\xi$ we can subrecursively compute the Dedekind cut of $\xi$ by

$$
\begin{aligned}
& T(q)<q \Rightarrow \xi<q \\
& T(q)>q \Rightarrow q<\xi
\end{aligned}
$$

## Dedekind cuts and trace functions

Given a trace function $T$ of an irrational number $\xi$ we can subrecursively compute the Dedekind cut of $\xi$ by

$$
\begin{aligned}
& T(q)<q \Rightarrow \xi<q \\
& T(q)>q \Rightarrow q<\xi
\end{aligned}
$$

But conversely, given the Dedekind cut of $\xi$ is not possible to obtain a trace function $T$ subrecursively.

## Dedekind cuts and trace functions

Given a trace function $T$ of an irrational number $\xi$ we can subrecursively compute the Dedekind cut of $\xi$ by

$$
\begin{aligned}
& T(q)<q \Rightarrow \xi<q \\
& T(q)>q \Rightarrow q<\xi
\end{aligned}
$$

But conversely, given the Dedekind cut of $\xi$ is not possible to obtain a trace function $T$ subrecursively. Given $q \in \mathbb{Q}$, an unbounded search is needed to find $T(q) \in \mathbb{Q}$, such that $q<T(q)<\xi$ or $\xi<T(q)<q$.

## First result

For a class $\mathcal{S}$ of functions, we denote by $\mathcal{S}_{T}, \mathcal{S}_{D}, \mathcal{S}_{C}$ the set of all real numbers, which have a trace function, Dedekind cut or Cauchy sequence in $\mathcal{S}$, respectively.

## First result

For a class $\mathcal{S}$ of functions, we denote by $\mathcal{S}_{T}, \mathcal{S}_{D}, \mathcal{S}_{C}$ the set of all real numbers, which have a trace function, Dedekind cut or Cauchy sequence in $\mathcal{S}$, respectively.
Theorem (Kristiansen)
For any subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$, closed under elementary operations we have

$$
\mathcal{S}_{T} \subset \mathcal{S}_{D} \subset \mathcal{S}_{C}
$$

## Base- $b$ expansions

From now on we consider only irrational numbers $\xi \in(0,1)$.

## Base- $b$ expansions

From now on we consider only irrational numbers $\xi \in(0,1)$. For any base $b \geq 2$, there exists a unique sequence $D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n} \ldots$ of $b$-digits, such that

$$
0 . D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n}<\xi<0 . D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n}+\frac{1}{b^{n}}
$$

for any number $n \in \mathbb{N}$.

## Base- $b$ expansions

From now on we consider only irrational numbers $\xi \in(0,1)$. For any base $b \geq 2$, there exists a unique sequence $D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n} \ldots$ of $b$-digits, such that

$$
0 . D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n}<\xi<0 . D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n}+\frac{1}{b^{n}}
$$

for any number $n \in \mathbb{N}$.
For a class $\mathcal{S}$ of functions, we denote by $\mathcal{S}_{b E}$ the set of all real numbers, whose sequence of $b$-digits belongs to $\mathcal{S}$.

## Base-b expansions

From now on we consider only irrational numbers $\xi \in(0,1)$. For any base $b \geq 2$, there exists a unique sequence $D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n} \ldots$ of $b$-digits, such that

$$
0 . D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n}<\xi<0 . D_{1} D_{2} \ldots D_{n}+\frac{1}{b^{n}}
$$

for any number $n \in \mathbb{N}$.
For a class $\mathcal{S}$ of functions, we denote by $\mathcal{S}_{b E}$ the set of all real numbers, whose sequence of $b$-digits belongs to $\mathcal{S}$.
Theorem (Mostowski, Kristiansen)
For any subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$, closed under elementary operations and any two bases $a, b$ we have

$$
\mathcal{S}_{b E} \subseteq \mathcal{S}_{a E} \Longleftrightarrow \text { every prime factor of } a \text { is a prime factor of } b
$$

## Base-b expansions II

It follows trivially that for any base $b$ there exists base $a$, such that $\mathcal{S}_{a E}$ and $\mathcal{S}_{b E}$ are not comparable with respect to inclusion.

## Base-b expansions II

It follows trivially that for any base $b$ there exists base $a$, such that $\mathcal{S}_{a E}$ and $\mathcal{S}_{b E}$ are not comparable with respect to inclusion. But from the considerations above we have $\mathcal{S}_{D} \subseteq \mathcal{S}_{a E} \subseteq \mathcal{S}_{C}$,

## Base-b expansions II

It follows trivially that for any base $b$ there exists base $a$, such that $\mathcal{S}_{a E}$ and $\mathcal{S}_{b E}$ are not comparable with respect to inclusion. But from the considerations above we have $\mathcal{S}_{D} \subseteq \mathcal{S}_{a E} \subseteq \mathcal{S}_{C}$, therefore

$$
\mathcal{S}_{T} \subset \mathcal{S}_{D} \subset \mathcal{S}_{b E} \subset \mathcal{S}_{C}
$$

for any subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$, closed under elementary operations and any base $b$.

## Base- $b$ sum approximations from below

Let us fix some base $b$. Any irrational number $\xi \in(0,1)$ can be written in the form

$$
\xi=\frac{d_{1}}{b^{k_{1}}}+\frac{d_{2}}{b^{k_{2}}}+\frac{d_{3}}{b^{k_{3}}}+\ldots
$$

where $k_{n}$ is a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers and $d_{n}$ are non-zero base- $b$ digits, $d_{n} \in\{1, \ldots, b-1\}$.

## Base- $b$ sum approximations from below

Let us fix some base $b$. Any irrational number $\xi \in(0,1)$ can be written in the form

$$
\xi=\frac{d_{1}}{b^{k_{1}}}+\frac{d_{2}}{b^{k_{2}}}+\frac{d_{3}}{b^{k_{3}}}+\ldots
$$

where $k_{n}$ is a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers and $d_{n}$ are non-zero base- $b$ digits, $d_{n} \in\{1, \ldots, b-1\}$.
Definition
The function $\hat{A}_{b}^{\xi}$, defined by $\hat{A}_{b}^{\xi}(n)=d_{n} b^{-k_{n}}$ for $n>0$ and $\hat{A}_{b}^{\xi}(0)=0$ is called base-b sum approximation from below of the number $\xi$.

## Base- $b$ sum approximations from below

Let us fix some base $b$. Any irrational number $\xi \in(0,1)$ can be written in the form

$$
\xi=\frac{d_{1}}{b^{k_{1}}}+\frac{d_{2}}{b^{k_{2}}}+\frac{d_{3}}{b^{k_{3}}}+\ldots
$$

where $k_{n}$ is a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers and $d_{n}$ are non-zero base- $b$ digits, $d_{n} \in\{1, \ldots, b-1\}$.
Definition
The function $\hat{A}_{b}^{\xi}$, defined by $\hat{A}_{b}^{\xi}(n)=d_{n} b^{-k_{n}}$ for $n>0$ and $\hat{A}_{b}^{\xi}(0)=0$ is called base-b sum approximation from below of the number $\xi$.
For a class of functions $\mathcal{S}$ we denote by $\mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow}$ the set of all real numbers, which have a base- $b$ sum approximation from below in $\mathcal{S}$, that is

$$
\xi \in \mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow} \Longleftrightarrow \hat{A}_{b}^{\xi} \in \mathcal{S}
$$

## Base- $b$ sum approximations from above

Moreover, we can write

$$
\xi=1-\frac{d_{1}^{\prime}}{b^{m_{1}}}-\frac{d_{2}^{\prime}}{b^{m_{2}}}-\frac{d_{3}^{\prime}}{b^{m_{3}}}-\ldots,
$$

where $m_{n}$ is a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers and $d_{n}^{\prime}$ are non-zero base- $b$ digits.

## Base- $b$ sum approximations from above

Moreover, we can write

$$
\xi=1-\frac{d_{1}^{\prime}}{b^{m_{1}}}-\frac{d_{2}^{\prime}}{b^{m_{2}}}-\frac{d_{3}^{\prime}}{b^{m_{3}}}-\ldots
$$

where $m_{n}$ is a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers and $d_{n}^{\prime}$ are non-zero base- $b$ digits.
Definition
The function $\check{A}_{b}^{\xi}$, defined by $\check{A}_{b}^{\xi}(n)=d_{n}^{\prime} b^{-m_{n}}$ for $n>0$ and $\breve{A}_{b}^{\xi}(0)=0$ is called base-b sum approximation from above of the number $\xi$.

## Base- $b$ sum approximations from above

Moreover, we can write

$$
\xi=1-\frac{d_{1}^{\prime}}{b^{m_{1}}}-\frac{d_{2}^{\prime}}{b^{m_{2}}}-\frac{d_{3}^{\prime}}{b^{m_{3}}}-\ldots
$$

where $m_{n}$ is a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers and $d_{n}^{\prime}$ are non-zero base- $b$ digits.
Definition
The function $\check{A}_{b}^{\xi}$, defined by $\check{A}_{b}^{\xi}(n)=d_{n}^{\prime} b^{-m_{n}}$ for $n>0$ and $\breve{A}_{b}^{\xi}(0)=0$ is called base-b sum approximation from above of the number $\xi$.
For a class of functions $\mathcal{S}$ we denote by $\mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow}$ the set of all real numbers, which have a base- $b$ sum approximation from above in $\mathcal{S}$, that is

$$
\xi \in \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow} \Longleftrightarrow \check{A}_{b}^{\xi} \in \mathcal{S} .
$$

## Example in base 10

For example, let us have $\xi=0.05439990003 \ldots$ in base $b=10$.

## Example in base 10

For example, let us have $\xi=0.05439990003 \ldots$ in base $b=10$. Then

$$
\xi=\frac{5}{10^{2}}+\frac{4}{10^{3}}+\frac{3}{10^{4}}+\frac{9}{10^{5}}+\frac{9}{10^{6}}+\frac{9}{10^{7}}+\frac{3}{10^{11}}+\ldots,
$$

## Example in base 10

For example, let us have $\xi=0.05439990003 \ldots$ in base $b=10$. Then

$$
\xi=\frac{5}{10^{2}}+\frac{4}{10^{3}}+\frac{3}{10^{4}}+\frac{9}{10^{5}}+\frac{9}{10^{6}}+\frac{9}{10^{7}}+\frac{3}{10^{11}}+\ldots,
$$

thus

$$
\hat{A}_{10}^{\xi}(1)=\frac{5}{10^{2}}, \quad \hat{A}_{10}^{\xi}(2)=\frac{4}{10^{3}}, \ldots
$$

## Example in base 10

For example, let us have $\xi=0.05439990003 \ldots$ in base $b=10$. Then

$$
\xi=\frac{5}{10^{2}}+\frac{4}{10^{3}}+\frac{3}{10^{4}}+\frac{9}{10^{5}}+\frac{9}{10^{6}}+\frac{9}{10^{7}}+\frac{3}{10^{11}}+\ldots,
$$

thus

$$
\hat{A}_{10}^{\xi}(1)=\frac{5}{10^{2}}, \quad \hat{A}_{10}^{\xi}(2)=\frac{4}{10^{3}}, \ldots
$$

Moreover,
$\xi=1-\frac{9}{10^{1}}-\frac{4}{10^{2}}-\frac{5}{10^{3}}-\frac{6}{10^{4}}-\frac{9}{10^{8}}-\frac{9}{10^{9}}-\frac{9}{10^{10}}-\frac{6}{10^{11}}+\ldots$,

## Example in base 10

For example, let us have $\xi=0.05439990003 \ldots$ in base $b=10$. Then

$$
\xi=\frac{5}{10^{2}}+\frac{4}{10^{3}}+\frac{3}{10^{4}}+\frac{9}{10^{5}}+\frac{9}{10^{6}}+\frac{9}{10^{7}}+\frac{3}{10^{11}}+\ldots,
$$

thus

$$
\hat{A}_{10}^{\xi}(1)=\frac{5}{10^{2}}, \quad \hat{A}_{10}^{\xi}(2)=\frac{4}{10^{3}}, \ldots
$$

Moreover,
$\xi=1-\frac{9}{10^{1}}-\frac{4}{10^{2}}-\frac{5}{10^{3}}-\frac{6}{10^{4}}-\frac{9}{10^{8}}-\frac{9}{10^{9}}-\frac{9}{10^{10}}-\frac{6}{10^{11}}+\ldots$,
thus

$$
\check{A}_{10}^{\xi}(1)=\frac{9}{10^{1}}, \quad \check{A}_{10}^{\xi}(2)=\frac{4}{10^{2}}, \ldots
$$

## Results on sum approximations

Theorem (Kristiansen)
Let $\mathcal{S}$ be a subrecursive class, closed under elementary operations. For any base $b$ we have

$$
\mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow} \nsubseteq \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow} \text { and } \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow} \nsubseteq \mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow} .
$$

## Results on sum approximations

Theorem (Kristiansen)
Let $\mathcal{S}$ be a subrecursive class, closed under elementary operations.
For any base $b$ we have

$$
\mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow} \nsubseteq \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow} \text { and } \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow} \nsubseteq \mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow}
$$

Theorem (Kristiansen)
Let $\mathcal{S}$ be a subrecursive class, closed under primitive recursive operations. For all bases $a, b$ we have

$$
\mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow} \subseteq \mathcal{S}_{a \uparrow} \Longleftrightarrow \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow} \subseteq \mathcal{S}_{a \downarrow}
$$

if and only if every prime factor of $a$ is a prime factor of $b$.

## General sum approximations

Let $\xi \in(0,1)$ be an irrational number and $b$ be any base.
Definition
The function $\hat{G}: \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$, such that

$$
\hat{G}(b, n)=\hat{A}_{b}^{\xi}(n), \quad \hat{G}(b, n)=0 \text { for } b<2
$$

will be called general sum approximation from below of $\xi$.

## General sum approximations

Let $\xi \in(0,1)$ be an irrational number and $b$ be any base.
Definition
The function $\hat{G}: \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$, such that

$$
\hat{G}(b, n)=\hat{A}_{b}^{\xi}(n), \quad \hat{G}(b, n)=0 \text { for } b<2
$$

will be called general sum approximation from below of $\xi$.
We denote by $\mathcal{S}_{g \uparrow}$ the set of all real numbers, which have a general sum approximation from below in $\mathcal{S}$.

## General sum approximations

Let $\xi \in(0,1)$ be an irrational number and $b$ be any base.
Definition
The function $\hat{G}: \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$, such that

$$
\hat{G}(b, n)=\hat{A}_{b}^{\xi}(n), \quad \hat{G}(b, n)=0 \text { for } b<2
$$

will be called general sum approximation from below of $\xi$.
We denote by $\mathcal{S}_{g \uparrow}$ the set of all real numbers, which have a general sum approximation from below in $\mathcal{S}$.

## Definition

The function $\check{G}: \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$, such that

$$
\check{G}(b, n)=\check{A}_{b}^{\xi}(n), \quad \check{G}(b, n)=0 \text { for } b<2,
$$

will be called general sum approximation from above of $\xi$.

## General sum approximations

Let $\xi \in(0,1)$ be an irrational number and $b$ be any base.
Definition
The function $\hat{G}: \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$, such that

$$
\hat{G}(b, n)=\hat{A}_{b}^{\xi}(n), \quad \hat{G}(b, n)=0 \text { for } b<2
$$

will be called general sum approximation from below of $\xi$.
We denote by $\mathcal{S}_{g \uparrow}$ the set of all real numbers, which have a general sum approximation from below in $\mathcal{S}$.

## Definition

The function $\check{G}: \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$, such that

$$
\check{G}(b, n)=\check{A}_{b}^{\xi}(n), \quad \check{G}(b, n)=0 \text { for } b<2,
$$

will be called general sum approximation from above of $\xi$.
We denote by $\mathcal{S}_{g \downarrow}$ the set of all real numbers, which have a general sum approximation from above in $\mathcal{S}$.

## Property of general sum approximations

A function $\hat{T}: \mathbb{Q} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$ will be called trace function from below for the irrational number $\xi$ if and only if $q<T(q)<\xi$ for any rational $q<\xi$.

## Property of general sum approximations

A function $\hat{T}: \mathbb{Q} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$ will be called trace function from below for the irrational number $\xi$ if and only if $q<T(q)<\xi$ for any rational $q<\xi$.
For any class of functions $\mathcal{S}$, let us denote by $\mathcal{S}_{T \uparrow}$ the set of all real numbers, which have a trace function from below in $\mathcal{S}$.

## Property of general sum approximations

A function $\hat{T}: \mathbb{Q} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$ will be called trace function from below for the irrational number $\xi$ if and only if $q<T(q)<\xi$ for any rational $q<\xi$.
For any class of functions $\mathcal{S}$, let us denote by $\mathcal{S}_{T \uparrow}$ the set of all real numbers, which have a trace function from below in $\mathcal{S}$. A function $\bar{T}: \mathbb{Q} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$ will be called trace function from above for the irrational number $\xi$ if and only if $q>T(q)>\xi$ for any rational $q>\xi$.

## Property of general sum approximations

A function $\hat{T}: \mathbb{Q} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$ will be called trace function from below for the irrational number $\xi$ if and only if $q<T(q)<\xi$ for any rational $q<\xi$.
For any class of functions $\mathcal{S}$, let us denote by $\mathcal{S}_{T \uparrow}$ the set of all real numbers, which have a trace function from below in $\mathcal{S}$. A function $\bar{T}: \mathbb{Q} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$ will be called trace function from above for the irrational number $\xi$ if and only if $q>T(q)>\xi$ for any rational $q>\xi$.
For any class of functions $\mathcal{S}$, let us denote by $\mathcal{S}_{T \downarrow}$ the set of all real numbers, which have a trace function from above in $\mathcal{S}$.

## Property of general sum approximations

A function $\hat{T}: \mathbb{Q} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$ will be called trace function from below for the irrational number $\xi$ if and only if $q<T(q)<\xi$ for any rational $q<\xi$.
For any class of functions $\mathcal{S}$, let us denote by $\mathcal{S}_{T \uparrow}$ the set of all real numbers, which have a trace function from below in $\mathcal{S}$.
A function $\bar{T}: \mathbb{Q} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$ will be called trace function from above for the irrational number $\xi$ if and only if $q>T(q)>\xi$ for any rational $q>\xi$.
For any class of functions $\mathcal{S}$, let us denote by $\mathcal{S}_{T \downarrow}$ the set of all real numbers, which have a trace function from above in $\mathcal{S}$.

## Proposition

For any subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$, closed under primitive recursive operations we have

$$
\mathcal{S}_{T \uparrow} \cap \mathcal{S}_{D}=\mathcal{S}_{g \uparrow} \text { and } \mathcal{S}_{T \downarrow} \cap \mathcal{S}_{D}=\mathcal{S}_{g \downarrow} .
$$

## Numbers with interesting properties

Let $P_{n}$ denote the $n$-th prime $\left(P_{0}=2, P_{1}=3, \ldots\right)$.
For any honest function $f$ we define the rational number $\alpha_{n}^{f}$ and the irrational number $\alpha^{f}$ by

$$
\alpha_{n}^{f}=\sum_{i=0}^{n} P_{i}^{-f(i)}, \quad \alpha^{f}=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \alpha_{n}^{f}
$$

## Numbers with interesting properties

Let $P_{n}$ denote the $n$-th prime $\left(P_{0}=2, P_{1}=3, \ldots\right)$.
For any honest function $f$ we define the rational number $\alpha_{n}^{f}$ and the irrational number $\alpha^{f}$ by

$$
\alpha_{n}^{f}=\sum_{i=0}^{n} P_{i}^{-f(i)}, \alpha^{f}=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \alpha_{n}^{f}
$$

In fact, $f$ is not arbitrary, it must satisfy a certain growth property, but the definition is easily modified to work in all cases.

## Numbers with interesting properties

Let $P_{n}$ denote the $n$-th prime $\left(P_{0}=2, P_{1}=3, \ldots\right)$.
For any honest function $f$ we define the rational number $\alpha_{n}^{f}$ and the irrational number $\alpha^{f}$ by

$$
\alpha_{n}^{f}=\sum_{i=0}^{n} P_{i}^{-f(i)}, \quad \alpha^{f}=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \alpha_{n}^{f}
$$

In fact, $f$ is not arbitrary, it must satisfy a certain growth property, but the definition is easily modified to work in all cases.
Theorem (Georgiev, Kristiansen, Stephan)
For any honest function $f$ and any base $b$ the function $\hat{A}_{b}^{\alpha^{f}}$ is elementary.

## Numbers with interesting properties

Let $P_{n}$ denote the $n$-th prime $\left(P_{0}=2, P_{1}=3, \ldots\right)$.
For any honest function $f$ we define the rational number $\alpha_{n}^{f}$ and the irrational number $\alpha^{f}$ by

$$
\alpha_{n}^{f}=\sum_{i=0}^{n} P_{i}^{-f(i)}, \quad \alpha^{f}=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \alpha_{n}^{f}
$$

In fact, $f$ is not arbitrary, it must satisfy a certain growth property, but the definition is easily modified to work in all cases.

## Theorem (Georgiev, Kristiansen, Stephan)

For any honest function $f$ and any base $b$ the function $\hat{A}_{b}^{\alpha^{f}}$ is elementary.

Theorem (Georgiev, Kristiansen, Stephan)
For any honest function $f$ we have $f \leq_{P R} \hat{G}$, where $\hat{G}$ is the general sum approximation from below of $\alpha^{f}$.

## Numbers with interesting properties II

Thus we have

$$
\mathcal{S}_{g \uparrow} \subset \bigcap_{b=2}^{\infty} \mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow}
$$

and a symmetric argument gives

$$
\mathcal{S}_{g \downarrow} \subset \bigcap_{b=2}^{\infty} \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow}
$$

for any subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$, closed under primitive recursive operations.

## Numbers with interesting properties II

Thus we have

$$
\mathcal{S}_{g \uparrow} \subset \bigcap_{b=2}^{\infty} \mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow}
$$

and a symmetric argument gives

$$
\mathcal{S}_{g \downarrow} \subset \bigcap_{b=2}^{\infty} \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow}
$$

for any subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$, closed under primitive recursive operations.
Theorem (Georgiev, Kristiansen, Stephan)
For any honest function $f$ there exists an elementary function $\check{T}: \mathbb{Q} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$, such that

$$
\check{T}(q)=0 \text { if } q<\alpha^{f}, \quad q>\check{T}(q)>\alpha^{f} \text { if } q>\alpha^{f} .
$$

## Numbers with interesting properties II

Thus we have

$$
\mathcal{S}_{g \uparrow} \subset \bigcap_{b=2}^{\infty} \mathcal{S}_{b \uparrow}
$$

and a symmetric argument gives

$$
\mathcal{S}_{g \downarrow} \subset \bigcap_{b=2}^{\infty} \mathcal{S}_{b \downarrow}
$$

for any subrecursive class $\mathcal{S}$, closed under primitive recursive operations.
Theorem (Georgiev, Kristiansen, Stephan)
For any honest function $f$ there exists an elementary function $\bar{T}: \mathbb{Q} \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$, such that

$$
\check{T}(q)=0 \text { if } q<\alpha^{f}, \quad q>\check{T}(q)>\alpha^{f} \text { if } q>\alpha^{f} .
$$

It follows that $\alpha_{f}$ has an elementary trace function from above, as well as elementary Dedekind cut.

## Numbers with interesting properties III

Let $\mathcal{S}$ be any subrecursive class, closed under primitive recursive operations.

## Numbers with interesting properties III

Let $\mathcal{S}$ be any subrecursive class, closed under primitive recursive operations.
Let us choose an honest function $f$, such that $f \notin \mathcal{S}$.

## Numbers with interesting properties III

Let $\mathcal{S}$ be any subrecursive class, closed under primitive recursive operations.
Let us choose an honest function $f$, such that $f \notin \mathcal{S}$.
Using the above results it follows that $\alpha^{f} \in \mathcal{S}_{T \downarrow} \cap \mathcal{S}_{D}=\mathcal{S}_{g \downarrow}$.

## Numbers with interesting properties III

Let $\mathcal{S}$ be any subrecursive class, closed under primitive recursive operations.
Let us choose an honest function $f$, such that $f \notin \mathcal{S}$.
Using the above results it follows that $\alpha^{f} \in \mathcal{S}_{T \downarrow} \cap \mathcal{S}_{D}=\mathcal{S}_{g \downarrow}$.
On the other hand, $\hat{G} \notin \mathcal{S}$, because $f \notin \mathcal{S}$.

## Numbers with interesting properties III

Let $\mathcal{S}$ be any subrecursive class, closed under primitive recursive operations.
Let us choose an honest function $f$, such that $f \notin \mathcal{S}$.
Using the above results it follows that $\alpha^{f} \in \mathcal{S}_{T \downarrow} \cap \mathcal{S}_{D}=\mathcal{S}_{g \downarrow}$.
On the other hand, $\hat{G} \notin \mathcal{S}$, because $f \notin \mathcal{S}$.
Thus we obtain $\mathcal{S}_{g \downarrow} \nsubseteq \mathcal{S}_{g \uparrow}$.

## Numbers with interesting properties III

Let $\mathcal{S}$ be any subrecursive class, closed under primitive recursive operations.
Let us choose an honest function $f$, such that $f \notin \mathcal{S}$.
Using the above results it follows that $\alpha^{f} \in \mathcal{S}_{T \downarrow} \cap \mathcal{S}_{D}=\mathcal{S}_{g \downarrow}$.
On the other hand, $\hat{G} \notin \mathcal{S}$, because $f \notin \mathcal{S}$.
Thus we obtain $\mathcal{S}_{g \downarrow} \nsubseteq \mathcal{S}_{g \uparrow}$.
A symmetric argument yields $\mathcal{S}_{g \uparrow} \nsubseteq \mathcal{S}_{g \downarrow}$.

## Bibliography

E Ivan Georgiev, Lars Kristiansen, Frank Stephan.
On general sum approximations of irrational numbers.
To be presented in full text at CIE 2018.
围 Lars Kristiansen.
On subrecursive representability of irrational numbers. Computability, 6(3):249-276, 2017.
圊 Lars Kristiansen.
On subrecursive representability of irrational numbers, part II. Computability, Preprint:1-23, 2017.

## My favourite theorem from logic course



# HAPPY 80TH ANNIVERSARY, PROFESSOR VAKARELOV! 

Thank you for your attention!

